

INITIATIVE FOR
Climate Action
Transparency

ICAT-A National Consultation Workshop

Bangladesh

BRAC Centre Inn, Mohakhali, Dhaka
07 February 2019



WORKSHOP REPORT



Introduction

The National Consultation Workshop under the ICAT- A project was held on February 07, 2019 to scope the priority areas for the Bangladesh aspect of the ICAT-A project to focus on. The workshop also planned to confirm participation of key members of the government, civil society and private sector. Some of the key points from the workshop can be found below.

Progress was made towards engagement with the government and other potential civil society and private sector organizations, this was facilitated through the ICAT team expressing the need and value of such a project for the stakeholders and for Bangladesh overall, and through participants expressing their recognition of this value and suggesting further points for action and recommending other valuable participants for the project.

Although, the priority sectors for ICAT-A project could not be finalized during the workshop, several other decisions were made during the workshop. There was more clarity about the stakeholders required for the advisory group and working group needed for implementing the project. An Advisory Group and a separate Working Group are to be established for the project for inputs into the many decisions during the implementation of the project.

Workshop Proceedings

Opening Session

The workshop started off with **Dr. Henry Neufeldt**, Senior Scientist, UNEP-DTU presenting the ICAT-A project before the workshop participants. Following that **Dr. Saleemul Huq**, Director, ICCCAD explained the motivation and potential benefits of the project to the audience.



The chief guest for the morning session was **Dr. Krishna Gayen**, Director General, Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics (BBS). Dr. Gayen highlighted the value in the collaborative nature of the project: given the resource and data limitations that the national government faces, combining these and learning from the practices of the other project partners could be incredibly beneficial for the country. She concluded by saying that ICAT-A was a good initiative to strengthen the knowledge base, as no country alone can tackle the problem of climate change. The Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics (BBS) is the hub for all sorts of economic, social and environmental data necessary for achieving the objective of climate adaptation transparency.



The partner countries India, South Africa, Dominican Republic, and Bangladesh, then presented on their country contexts and proposed theory of change.

Dominican Republic

Ms. Karen Hedeman from the Dominican Republic briefly described the objectives of their institute called National Council for Climate Change Clean Development Mechanism (CNCCMDL). The country is vulnerable to climate change, and the country wishes to be a part of ICAT in order to strengthen their actions towards SDG 13. Various activities carried out in the country to meet the goal and the formation of a steering committee were presented during the session.

India

Mr. Ganesh Gorti from India introduced TERI and spoke about various climate change issues in the country. India has high dependence on rainfall similar to Bangladesh and suffers from scarcity of drinking water. The government faces extreme challenges dealing with the disproportionality in the economic systems. Hence, sustainable pathways are challenging when it comes to dealing with climate variability and unpredictable changes in weather patterns. For the purpose of ICAT-A, agriculture, water, and human health have been identified as priority sectors. There are several development policies that can be built around adaptation. Therefore, this project is deemed as suitable for India, where the hope is it would enhance capacities and operationalize adaptation.

South Africa

Ms. Sasha Naidoo presented on how South Africa is also highly vulnerable to climate change. Temperature trends were presented which indicate a drastic increase over the last five decades and as a result, the rising temperatures in the future can be projected. In this regard, the ICAT-

A project for South Africa would contribute to monitoring the early warning systems to overcome the disaster risks in the coastal areas. The project will measure and track gaps at the national level.

Bangladesh

The Bangladesh case was presented by **Dr. Feisal Rahman** from International Centre for Climate Change and Development (ICCCAD). Part of Bangladesh's interest in this project relates to its history with climate policy and the several interventions undertaken to address the impacts of climate change. As Bangladesh graduates economically (i.e. from an LDC to a LMIC), a higher standard of governance is expected from donors and economic partners. In this regard some of the ongoing efforts in the country related to this project include: UNDP's work on climate resilience indicators; the climate finance transparency mechanism and interventions in government budget protocol (linked to country-wide capacity-building for transparency); NDC implementation; the Delta plan 2100; development of NAP, 8th 5-Year Plan, 2nd phase of the Bangladesh Climate Change Strategy and Action Plan (BCCSAP).

High-Level Closing Session

The evening session was attended by a wide variety of stakeholders, including Mr. Mamunur Rashid (UNDP), Dr. Fazle Rabbi (PKSF), Mr. Mirza Shawkat Ali (DoE), Dr. Hamidul Huq (UIU), Mr. Zakir Khan (TIB), who shared their insights about the initiative, the state of adaptation to climate change and tracking adaptation projects in Bangladesh. The session was closed by the chief guest, Dr. Shamsul Alam, Senior Secretary, Planning Commission. Dr. Alam emphasized on the need for coordinated action on climate change adaptation. Some of the key points mentioned by the speakers from the evening session are briefly mentioned below:

Mr. Mamunur Rashid, UNDP, remarked that measuring adaptation is a global dilemma. It is a milestone that we all need to achieve. The practitioners have an inbuilt responsibility to ensure that this is done. Climate change is one of the biggest problems for the national government and as a development partner, UNDP is working with the them to enhance the country's climate resilience. He mentioned that Ministry of Finance is regularly updating the nation's climate budget, and UNDP is supporting them to identify key priorities in the budget and develop budgeting frameworks. He highlighted that adaptation is context specific and therefore different for different areas. There is no one-size-fits-all solution for measurement. Therefore, a multilayered approach needs to be taken for measuring adaptation, one that is related to people, systems, technologies, etc.



This was followed by a speech from **Dr. Fazle Rabbi**, PKSF. He started off by saying highlighting that adaptation is highly localized being country specific as well as local area specific. Therefore, tools for measuring and evaluating adaptation must be developed in consultation with local so that their needs are adequately accounted for. The community should be involved both in the input and the output processes. PKSF mainly works in three vulnerable areas in Bangladesh. Based on the level of importance of the various environmental and climate change risks in those areas, PKSF allocates emphasis on different issues and then plans activities around them – and these are all community focused. After that the stakeholders and the target population are invited and the index for monitoring is then structured. He believes that PKSF needs to translate this process into the national level and customize it so that it can be suitable for adaptation methods in different areas. He states the need for a cluster of activities at the local level and national level frameworks, which will then feed into policies.



Mr. Mirza Shawkat from the Department of Environment (DoE) shared that they are working on different areas in regard to climate change. However, there is a limitation in manpower when it comes to implementing adaptation monitoring. He shared some of the activities of the department, the policy that was signed. He said that adaptation is a significant priority for the department, as Bangladesh is a leader in adaptation. In regard to ICAT, he said that transparency is very much the concern for them and the country's NDC has agendas for both adaptation and mitigation. He then explained the process by which the NAP is made and said that M&E tools developed as a result of this project can very well be institutionalized.



Following this, **Dr. Hamidul Huq**, UIU, shared some of his views. He began by mentioning that the term transparency in Bangladesh is often associated with corruption. He remarked that while we often hail our national practices in terms of climate mitigation or adaptation, there still remains doubts when it comes to actual actions taken. There are also significant gaps and challenges when it comes to information access and sharing in the country.

Mr. Zakir Hossain Khan, TIB, spoke about the project tracking method initiated by them and subsequently adopted by several other organizations. Over 100 projects, in the country, implemented by both the government and non-government entities have been tracked using

this method and employing a range of indicators. Recently they completed work on an adaptation fund governance tracker method that can be shared and utilized by others as it covers a lot of policy issues. He feels that learning should occur cross-organizationally. Acknowledging the existing practices and then focusing on developing new ones would be the way forward. Otherwise there is always a risk that resources will be wasted. Also, the focus should always be on the community.

The chair of the event **Dr. Saleemul Huq**, Director, ICCCAD wrapped up the evening discussion session. He reflected on some of the points made by the speakers. He highlighted that there needs to be a learning tool methodology applied before the actual product can be used and it needs to be customized according to context. He also said that community based ideas are always the result of a lot of experience and allows for dispersion of knowledge from the local to the national to the global level.



To close off the event Dr. Huq said that transparency is two sided. The polluters should ideally provide relief due to the impacts that led to the need for adaptation in the developing countries. There should be appropriate utilization of funds on the ground. Bangladesh has positioned itself as a leader in adaptation and can therefore lead the process for developing needed M&E framework. This can then be shared across the four partner countries and then globally. This project is therefore an opportunity to achieve all of that.

The session was closed by the chief guest, **Dr. Shamsul Alam**, Senior Secretary, Planning Commission. He started off by saying that in times of such climate adversities it is important to know how to manage the limited natural resources the country has to offer. This will require long term planning. Many initiatives have been taken to incorporate climate change in development planning processes, and climate change spending is included in the national budget. While there are a lot of adaptive techniques in the country, there is a gap when it comes to accountability. The role of ICCCAD in engaging in a project that aims to develop M&E indicators to ensure accountability is much appreciated. He believes in the need for unity within the various ministries for succeeding in such a project. He ended his talk by stating that he values the goals of ICAT-A project, as it tries to understand adaptation effectiveness within Bangladesh, and supports national efforts for improving climate governance.



M&E-related Gaps highlighted by Participants

One of the key objectives of the project and of the workshop was to better understand some of the gaps in the existing Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) practices in Bangladesh. The event allowed for active discussion among the participants regarding this issue. Some of the key points highlighted by the participants include the following:

1. How to align concerns with adaptation and development [this has some normative elements]:
 - Matter of mainstreaming or keeping separate? (GoB has strong focus on achieving SDGs, but international community wants to see 'climate-specific' projects)
 - Is doing development 'right' adaptation in itself?
 - Is adaptation about thinking bigger, about 'transformation'?
 - Need for goals, what do we want to achieve through adaptation?
 - Need to clarify, who do we mean by adaptation? The matter of additionality
2. What do actors on the ground need to know in order to become more risk-informed?
 - How to integrate community risk preferences (i.e. the level of risk communities are willing to take)?
3. Is knowledge enough?
 - How do we address systemic vulnerability? (This is a fundamental question for dealing with adaptation, but it brings up government-sensitive issues as adaptation requires access to resources)
 - There is a political economy of preparedness which concerns what politicians (and other actors) get from preparation and relief?
4. Existing issues with recording data, usefulness/comprehensiveness of indicators, verification processes relate to questions of how to establish whose duty it is to monitor and evaluate; currently the chain of responsibility is fragmented both in the public and private sector and continued challenges of quantification and aggregation; can ameliorate these with narrative element of adaptation experience
5. How to identify impacts of particular adaptation interventions: overlap between work done by different organizations, different projects may complicate M&E
6. Need to establish what work has already been done in order to avoid duplication and waste of resources
7. Need to align project process (i.e. development of toolkit) with the needs of communities

Potential Stakeholder for Future Engagement

During the workshop suggestions were made by the participants and present stakeholders about the potential stakeholders who would become part of the advisory group and the working group for the project. Some of the suggested organizations are listed below:

Potential Stakeholders for being Members of AG/WG

- Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics
- Ministry of Environment, Forestry and Climate Change
- Ministry of Agriculture
- Ministry of Disaster Management and Relief
- Department of Environment
- IMED
- Bangladesh Climate Change Trust
- Planning Commission
- IDCOL
- PKSf
- UNDP
- BRAC
- CARE

Key Decisions from the Workshop

The discussion amongst the stakeholders and project team members and partner countries led to some decisions that would help start off the implementation of the project. The discussed points include the following:

1. Creation of a working group (WG) is needed to complement the advisory group (AG);
 - Members for this WG should be nominated by initial contacts solicited for AG participation
 - AG will meet on a bi-monthly basis to give feedback and receive updates
 - Need to draft a ToR for these groups
2. Develop different sets of indicators for planners, implementers, evaluators, as well as potentially different indicators across regions and sectors
3. ICCCAD will meet with AG and other stakeholders to finalize the focus areas. Some of the focus areas implicit in discussion are:
 - Coastal areas
 - Disaster risk reduction
 - Urban areas

4. Need for risk awareness/climate change capacity assessment within organizations engaging in CCA in order to establish what actors on the ground need to know in order to become more risk-informed; this also links with the implicit suggestion of many participants about the need to establish a climate risk assessment within projects during the planning process (e.g. as a component of national CBA guidelines)
 - Both of these actions can help to mainstream climate concern and expand climate knowledge across relevant actors
 - Current risk assessment practices focus on DRR/short-term considerations, need to extend these into long-term for adaptation

Annex I: PARTICIPANTS SURVEY OVERVIEW

Following the full day event, the participants were given a short questionnaire to fill out. The questionnaire was to assess some of the existing ideas of adaptation to climate change in Bangladesh. The findings from the survey are as the following:

1. When enquired about the priority climate change adaptation sectors in Bangladesh the following sections were highlighted:
 - Agriculture and Food Security (12)
 - Water/Water Resource Management (10)
 - Disaster Prone Infrastructure and Housing (7)
 - Health and Sanitation (5)
 - Energy and Transport(4)
 - Livelihood (mostly agricultural sector, fisheries, livestock) (3)
 - Land & soil (1)
 - Planned migration for displaced people (1)
 - Climate change induced disaster resilience (1)
 - Waste management and drainage (1)

2. When enquired about some of the gaps and challenges that they have faced with regards to M&E of adaptation or tracking progress of adaptation, the following issues were highlighted by the participants:
 - Need for introduction of Result Based Monitoring system for projects. Current M&E embedded within projects are not usually effective
 - Knowledge and training in terms of adaptation and monitoring adaptation is needed
 - Adaptation related project need to be better identified in order to distinguish them from other development projects
 - No separate wing in IMED for M&E of climate change adaptation related projects
 - There is a need for context specific M&E framework for reporting. Definition and methodology for measuring still not defined
 - No sector wise and multilayer indicator set for reporting on success of adaptation projects
 - No community led monitoring in place. Community based M&E learning needed at national level and global level
 - Lack of sufficient sets of data and baseline information. There is a gap in long term research regarding the tools and methods needed for M&E of adaptation and tracking progress of adaptation
 - No follow up mechanism in place after project completion phase. The effectiveness of interventions are not monitored in any way.

- Given the uncertainty and unpredictable impacts of climate change it is difficult to certify any initiative as sustainable adaptation.
 - No regular monitoring system and inspection system in place
 - The M&E tools of the adaptation projects in Bangladesh are unable to capture the additionality of climate risks and establish/measure the linkage of the interventions and desired impact
3. When enquired about any similar initiatives on M&E of adaptation in Bangladesh, the participants mentioned the following:
- MRV mentioned in NDC.
 - TI-BD has developed "CCA project tracing method" and CCA fund governance standard assessment. Where every project has its own log frame and indicator set and based on that progress is monitored.
 - BRAC has a reporting framework called SPA-RF. The climate change indicators are outcome driven
 - Action Research for Community Based Adaptation in Bangladesh (ARCAB) implemented by BCAS, ICCCAD and a number of partners
4. Additionally when enquired about whether M&E of adaptation will benefit the country all the participant surveys denoted that it will.
5. Through the survey it was found that about 53% of the participants have some knowledge or training on M&E methods and practices, whereas the remaining 47% do not have any knowledge
6. All participants were asked if they would like to be a part of the ICAT-A initiative and all of them have said they would like to contribute in some way.

Annex II: WORKSHOP AGENDA

Time	Session
09:30 am - 10:00 am	Registration
10:00 am – 11:00am	Opening Session <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Welcome address: Dr. Saleemul Huq, Director, ICCCAD • Overview of the ICAT-A Project: Henry Neufeldt, Senior Scientist, UNEP-DTU Partnership • Opening remarks by Chief Guest: Dr. Krishna Gayen, Director General, Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics (BBS) • Opening remarks by Special Guests: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Mirza Shawkat Ali, Director (Climate Change and Int'l Convention, Department of Environment (DoE) ○ Dr. Fazle Rabbi Sadeque Ahmed, Director (Environment & Climate Change), PKSF
11:00 am – 11:15 am	TEA BREAK
11:15 am – 11:45 am	Partner Country Contexts <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Presentations from project partner countries <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Bangladesh: International Centre for Climate Change and Development (ICCCAD) ○ Dominican Republic: National Council for Climate Change and Clean Development Mechanism (CNCCMDL) ○ India: The Energy Research Institute (TERI) ○ South Africa: Centre for Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR)
11:45 am – 01:00 pm	Facilitated Discussion <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Experience sharing from participants • Highlighting opportunities and challenges
01:00 pm - 02:00 pm	LUNCH
02:00 pm – 03:00 pm	Facilitated Discussion (cont'd)
03:00 pm - 03:30 pm	TEA BREAK
03:30 pm – 05:00 pm	Closing Session <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Keynote and workshop summary: Henry Neufeldt, Senior Scientist, UNEP-DTU Partnership • Open discussion and feedback • Closing remarks by Chief Guest: Dr. Shamsul Alam, Member (Senior Secretary), General Economics Division (GED), Planning Commission • Concluding remarks: Dr. Saleemul Huq, Director, ICCCAD