Agenda

- Introduction to ICAT (5 min)
- Transformational Change Guidance (20 min)
- Q&A (10 min)
- Stakeholder Participation Guidance (5 min)
- Technical Review Guidance (5 min)
- How to provide comments (10 min)
- Q&A (5 min)
Introduction to ICAT
ICAT objectives

Provide policymakers around the world with tools and support to measure and assess the impacts of their climate policies and actions, to further transparent and ambitious climate action.

Two components:

- ICAT series of guidance
- Country engagement to build capacity for MRV
Multi-stakeholder partnership

DONORS

Children's Investment Fund Foundation

ClimateWorks

GRANT MANAGEMENT

UNOPS

UNEP DTU Partnership

VCS

WORLD RESOURCES INSTITUTE

IMPLEMENTATION PARTNERS

MINISTERO DELL'AMBIENTE
E DELLA TUTela DEL TERRITORIO E DEL MARE

SUPPORTING PARTNERS

Rainforest Alliance

CCBA

The Climate, Community & Biodiversity Alliance

NEWCLIMATE INSTITUTE

Infras

ghg management institute

CDP

DRIVING SUSTAINABLE ECONOMIES

THE CLIMATE GROUP
ICAT Guidance

Introduction to the series of guidance
Who can use the guidance?

- Governments
- Donor agencies and financial institutions
- Businesses
- Research institutions and non-government organisations (NGOs)
- Stakeholders affected by policies and actions, such as local communities and civil society organisations
What can the guidance be used for?

- **Deciding** on policy/action design and implementation
- **Understanding** effectiveness of policies/actions
- **Reporting** on policy/action impacts

**ex-ante**

**ex-post**

Initiative for Climate Action Transparency
Guidance development process

- Run stakeholder survey (Q1, 2016)
- Convene working groups (Q2, 2016)
- Country scoping and work plan development (Q3, 2016)
- Develop first drafts of guidance (Q4, 2016)
- First public consultation (Q1, 2017)
- Country feedback (Q2, 2017)
- Develop second drafts of guidance (Q3, 2017)
- Second public consultation (Q4, 2017)
- Finalise and release guidance (third drafts) (Q1, 2018)
- Capacity building (Q2, 2018)
- Country feedback (Q3, 2018)
- Develop second drafts of guidance (Q4, 2018)
- Second public consultation (Q1, 2019)
- Finalise and release guidance (third drafts) (Q2, 2019)
Principles for guidance development

- **Enabling**
  - User-friendly guidance, not rules and requirements

- **Flexible**
  - Non-prescriptive, accommodates national circumstances

- **Optionality**
  - Not mandatory to follow all steps

- **Leveraging**
  - Build upon existing and emerging work

- **Participatory**
  - Engage broadly in development processes
Definition of transformational change

- Transformational change is defined in this guidance as:

  A fundamental, sustained change of a system that disrupts established high-carbon practices and contributes to a zero-carbon society in line with the Paris Agreement’s 1.5 - 2 °C temperature goal and the UN Sustainable Development Goals.
Characteristics of transformational change

Transformational impact

Outcomes - GHGs and SDGs

Processes

- Technology
- Agents
- Incentives
- Norms

Scale of outcome
Sustained nature of outcome
Examples of transformational change

Developing country examples:

• *Brazil*: The drivers of deforestation - a 75% drop over a decade (2005-2014)
• *Columbia*: Sustainable transport in Bogotá – the role of political will & technical solutions at city level
• *South Africa*: The role of state-owned companies to lead an incremental transition away from high-carbon lock-in to a low-carbon future

Developed country examples:

• *Germany*: Energy system transformation - the role of laws and regulatory frameworks for renewable energy
• *Denmark*: The role of wind power towards 100% renewable energy in electricity production by 2050

Purpose of the guidance

The guidance is developed to help a wide range of users, including governments, donor agencies and financial institutions, businesses, research institutions and non-governmental organisations (NGOs), with the following objectives in mind:

• To help users assess the extent of transformation expected or achieved by policies or actions
• To help decision makers develop effective strategies for transformational change through better understanding of how policies or actions can set in motion processes that lead to transformational outcomes
• To support transparent and consistent reporting of transformational impacts
Scope and applicability of the guidance

- General guidance including principles, concepts and procedures that users can follow when assessing the transformational impacts of a policy or action.
- Applicable to all types of policies or actions in all sectors.
- Flexible guidance, users should apply it considering their own objectives and circumstances.
- Qualitative approach with the option to quantitatively assess indicators of transformational change as the basis for qualitative assessment.
- A limitation of the generic approach is that it does not provide a comprehensive list of indicators for transformational change covering the specifics of all sectors.
Guidance development process

- First draft developed through a multi-stakeholder process between July 2017 and July 2018:
  - Secretariat: UNEP DTU Partnership and World Resources Institute
  - Technical Working Group: 23 members
  - Drafting Team (part of TWG): 8+ members
- First draft out for a 60 day public comment period through September 24
- The draft guidance will be applied in several countries to test how it works in practice and produce case studies to include in the final version
Guidance structure

Part I: Introduction, objectives and steps
Understand the purpose, applicability and limitations of the guidance (Chapter 1)
Determine the objectives of the assessment (Chapter 2)
Understand what is meant by transformational change (Chapter 3)
Understand key concepts, steps and assessment principles (Chapter 4)

Part II: Defining the assessment
Describe the policy or action to be assessed and the vision for transformational change (Chapter 5)
Choose which transformational change characteristics to assess (Chapter 6)

Part III: Impact assessment
Assess the starting situation (Chapter 7)
Estimate transformational impacts ex-ante (Chapter 8)
Estimate transformational impacts ex-post (Chapter 9)

Part IV: Monitoring and reporting
Monitor the performance of the policy or action over time (Chapter 10)
Report the results and methodology used (Chapter 11)

Part V: Decision-making and using results
Learning, decision-making and interpreting results (Chapter 12)
## Chapter 5: Describe the policy or action

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Information</th>
<th>Example - hypothetical solar PV policy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Title of the policy or action</strong></td>
<td>Grid-Connected Solar Rooftop Programme. Throughout this guidance, it is referred to as the “Solar PV policy”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Type of policy or action</strong></td>
<td>Financial incentive policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description of specific interventions</strong></td>
<td>The policy includes two specific interventions: 1) A financial subsidy up to 30% of project/benchmark cost for rooftop solar projects in the residential/institutional and social sectors. It also provides concessional loans to solar rooftop project developers. 2) A feed-in tariff for all new grid-connected solar rooftop and small solar power plants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Status of the policy or action</strong></td>
<td>The policy has been implemented (currently in effect)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Date of implementation</strong></td>
<td>1 January 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Date of completion (if relevant)</strong></td>
<td>The provision of financial incentives and feed-in tariff ends on 31 December 2022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Implementing entity or entities</strong></td>
<td>Government funds are disbursed by the ministry to state agencies, financial institutions, implementing agencies and other government approved channel partners that includes renewable energy service providers, system integrators, manufacturers, vendors and NGOs.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Objectives and intended impacts or benefits of the policy or action** | The policy has set the following goals:  
1) Annual emission reductions of 200,000 tCO2e  
2) 2,000 new green jobs (e.g., in solar PV installation and maintenance sectors) created by 2022 |
| **Level of the policy or action**        | National                                                                                               |
| **Geographic coverage**                  | Country wide                                                                                            |
| **Sectors targeted**                     | Energy supply, grid-connected solar PV                                                                  |
| **Other related policies or actions**    | The Government targets installation of 100,000 MW of solar power by 2022 of which 40,000 MW is to be achieved through rooftop solar power plants through the solar PV policy. |
Chapter 5: Describe the vision of transformational change

- Identify levels of change:
  - Macro level: global, international
  - Medium level: national, sectoral, mega cities, states/provinces
  - Micro level: sub-national, local, towns

- Solar PV policy supported by international donors
- Transformational change
- Grid, Solar PV, Hydro
- Lighting, Power supply
## Chapter 5: Describe the vision of transformational change

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Levels of society and time periods</th>
<th>Description of the vision for desired societal and technical changes at each level and time period</th>
<th>Example: Solar PV policy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Global or international level (macro level)</td>
<td>Describe the vision for desired changes at this level</td>
<td>Contributing to the global vision of zero-carbon and sustainable development, the desired future change is to achieve zero carbon electricity production with international support. The policy does not result in a change at the global level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National or sectoral level (medium level)</td>
<td>Describe the vision for desired changes at this level</td>
<td>The policy has set the following goals at the national/sectoral level: Annual emission reductions of 200,000 tCO₂e 2000 new green jobs (e.g., in solar PV installation and maintenance sectors)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subnational level (micro level)</td>
<td>Describe the vision for desired changes at this level</td>
<td>The solar PV policy is implemented at subnational levels supported by incentives for private sector involvement and knowledge development. In rural districts and towns solar PV mini-grids enable economic growth, poverty reduction and new jobs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long-term change (≥15 years)</td>
<td>Describe the long-term vision for transformational change</td>
<td>The long-term vision by 2050 is to achieve 60% solar PV in the national electricity mix and create 10,000 new green jobs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium-term change (≥5 years and &lt;15 years)</td>
<td>Describe the medium-term vision for transformational change</td>
<td>The mid-term vision by 2030 is to achieve 30% solar PV in the national electricity mix and create 5,000 new green jobs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short-term change (&lt;5 years)</td>
<td>Describe the short-term vision for transformational change</td>
<td>The short-term vision by 2022 is to install 40,000 MW of rooftop solar PV and create 2000 new green jobs in doing so</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 6: Choosing which transformational change characteristics to assess
Chapters 7-9: Impact assessment

- Identify the phase of transformation:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase</th>
<th>Support most needed for</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#1 Pre-development</td>
<td>Pioneer activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#2 Take-off</td>
<td>Coalition building</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#3 Acceleration</td>
<td>Regulatory change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#4 Stabilisation at a new level or relapse</td>
<td>Anchoring of societal acceptance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapters 7-9: Impact assessment

- Identify barriers for transformation:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Barriers</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
<th>Characteristics affected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Institutional and political</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of a strategy or political will to discourage fossil fuel energy</td>
<td>Existing or foreseeable energy strategy dominantly envisages expansion of coal-fired generation capacity and only limited expansion of solar PV. This barrier makes it difficult to introduce regulatory changes promoting a feed-in tariff high enough to make solar PV power attractive to private sector investments.</td>
<td>Institutional and regulatory changes Behaviour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technology barriers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited availability of technology</td>
<td>There is very little manufacturing of solar PV components in the country so components need to be imported. This barrier hampers adoption and scale-up of new PV technology.</td>
<td>Adoption Scale up</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capacity constraints</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of technical personnel for installation and maintenance</td>
<td>Lack of trained technicians for solar PV installation slows down a potential scale-up of PV technology.</td>
<td>Scale up</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial constraints</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High upfront financial investment needed for solar PV</td>
<td>Lack of financial instruments to support customers in financing solar PV weaken the economic incentive and the enabling environment for entrepreneurs to develop new business models for solar PV solutions.</td>
<td>Economic incentive Entrepreneurs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Chapters 7-9: Impact assessment

- **Identify the starting situation of characteristics - example**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Process category</th>
<th>Process characteristic</th>
<th>Description of the starting situation</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Technology</td>
<td>Research and development</td>
<td>Not relevant</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Adoption         | Relevant. High capital cost of rooftop systems and longer pay back periods have discouraged its widespread adoption by small consumers in residential and commercial sectors. | - Number of innovative business models (e.g., to overcome cost barriers of solar PV rooftop)  
- Number of new demonstration projects for solar rooftop PV initiated  
- Number of government programs and measures (including at subnational level) to support adoption of solar rooftop PV |
| Scale-up         | Relevant. Solar rooftop has a negligible share in the solar energy sector. There is a huge amount of untapped potential in the solar rich country. Several barriers exist to large scale deployment of rooftop PV (e.g., lack of manufacturing facilities and high skilled workforce, high upfront cost) | - Share of installed PV rooftop in the solar sector (nationwide or statewide)  
- Number of training workshops/certifications for solar workforce  
- Number of manufacturing facilities for solar PV |
| Other            |                        |                                       |            |
Chapters 7-9: Impact assessment

- Scale for scoring barriers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scale</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High impact</td>
<td>The barrier has the potential to completely counteract the envisaged effect of the characteristic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium impact</td>
<td>The barrier is expected to have a moderate impact on the achievement of a characteristic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low impact</td>
<td>The barrier is expected to have a very limited impact on the achievement of a characteristic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapters 7-9: Impact assessment

- Scale for scoring characteristics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scale</th>
<th>Description of scale</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Process characteristics</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>If a characteristic represents a key element of the policy or action design, and there are no or only low impact barriers to implementation, it can realistically be expected that the policy or action will impact this characteristic over the assessment period</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>If a characteristic is an important part of the policy or action design but not the main focus and there are medium impact barriers to implementation, it can realistically be expected that the policy or action will directly or indirectly impact this characteristic over the assessment period</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>If a characteristic is not an important part of the policy or action design and there are high impact barriers to implementation, it is less likely that the policy or action will directly or indirectly impact this characteristic over the assessment period</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>If a characteristic is not at all a part of the policy or action design, it is unlikely that the policy or action will impact this characteristic over the assessment period</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outcome characteristics – scale</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The policy or action results in GHG and sustainable development impacts that relative to the starting situation represent large emission reductions and significant, positive sustainable development impacts at the level of assessment targeted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The policy or action results in GHG and sustainable development impacts that relative to the starting situation represent moderate emissions reductions and moderate, positive sustainable development impacts at the level of assessment targeted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The policy or action results in GHG and sustainable development impacts that relative to the starting situation represent minor emission reductions and minor, positive sustainable development impacts at the level of assessment targeted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>The policy or action does not result in GHG and sustainable development impacts relative to the starting situation at the level of assessment targeted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-1</td>
<td>The policy or action results in GHG and sustainable development impacts that relative to the starting situation represent a net increase in emissions or negative sustainable development impacts at the level of assessment targeted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outcome characteristics – time</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The policy or action results in GHG and sustainable development impacts that are very likely to be sustained over the assessment period</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The policy or action results in GHG and sustainable development impacts that are likely to be sustained within the assessment period</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The policy or action results in GHG and sustainable development impacts that are less likely to be sustained within the assessment period</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>The policy or action results in GHG and sustainable development impacts that are not expected to be sustained over the assessment period</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Chapters 7-9: Impact assessment

- Aggregate results of the assessment - process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Rationale for scoring</th>
<th>Relative importance</th>
<th>Rationale for importance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Technology</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>The policy or action will positively influence the penetration of solar in the country. Since the technology is known, adoption and scale up are important to focus on over the assessment period.</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>The country is still in the pre-development phase, which emphasises the importance of introducing new solar PV technology.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agents</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Overall the policy is likely to engage entrepreneurs in bringing transformation. A greater emphasis is needed to tap into the beneficiaries and others who can potentially play a key role in preventing policy reversal.</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>Entrepreneurs who can introduce and lead technology penetration is equally important to technology change.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incentives</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The policy is likely to fully utilise financial incentives and institutions and regulations; however it is not likely to utilise disincentives to discourage the use of fossil fuels.</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>In a developing country context the role of financial incentives is crucial to support technology and agents of change.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norms</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>The policy is less likely to bring significant shifts in this category.</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>Demonstrating the benefits of solar PV technology is more important than changing norms in society at this early stage of transition.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapters 7-9: Impact assessment

- Aggregate results of the assessment - outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Rationale for scoring</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Scale of outcome</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The policy is expected to result in GHG and sustainable development impacts that relative to the starting situation represent <em>moderate</em> impacts at national and subnational levels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcome sustained over time</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Based on the policy’s expected impact on adoption and scale up, it is <em>highly likely</em> that the policy or action will sustain the penetration of solar in the country over the assessment period.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapters 7-9: Impact assessment

- Transformational impact:
Mathematical approach

- Appendix C describes the option of using a mathematical approach: *example*
## Chapter 10: Monitoring performance over time

- **Template for data collection** – *illustrated for the solar PV policy example*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Type of data (quantitative/ qualitative)</th>
<th>Monitoring frequency and date of collection</th>
<th>Data source/ collection method</th>
<th>Responsible entity</th>
<th>Observed data (unit)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of new solar PV installation businesses</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Annual (January 2015)</td>
<td>Business license application</td>
<td>Department of Commerce or Energy</td>
<td>8 businesses /year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of trainings on solar PV installation</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td>Training workshop reports</td>
<td>Department of Energy</td>
<td>1 training /month</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% share of solar PV in electricity mix</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Annual (January 2015)</td>
<td>Electricity generation data</td>
<td>Department of Energy</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 11: Reporting

- Provides recommended information to report, including:
  - Information about the policy or action and vision of transformational change
  - The results: estimated impact of the policy or action on the transformational characteristics of society that are included in the assessment
  - Methodology and assumptions used
Chapter 12: Learning, decision making and using results

- The usefulness of transformational change assessment at different stages of policy planning and implementation
Questions?
Introducing guidance to support stakeholder participation in design, implementation and assessment of policies and actions, including of transformational impacts
Why stakeholder participation is important

- Raise awareness and enable better understanding for all parties involved
- Build trust, collaboration, shared ownership and support for policies
- Address stakeholder perceptions of risks and impacts, and reduce negative impacts and enhance benefits for all stakeholder groups
- Enhance the credibility, accuracy and comprehensiveness of the assessment, drawing on diverse expert and local knowledge
- Enhance transparency, accountability and legitimacy
- Enable enhanced ambition and finance by strengthening the effectiveness of policies and the credibility of reporting
### When stakeholder participation is important

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter/step in this guidance document</th>
<th>Why stakeholder participation is important at this step</th>
<th>Relevant chapters in <em>Stakeholder Participation Guidance</em></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Chapter 6 - Choosing which transformational change characteristics to assess | • Enhance completeness of identification of transformational change characteristics with stakeholder insights  
• Ensure indicators and frequency of monitoring reflect stakeholder interests and information needs | Chapter 8 – Designing and conducting consultations |
Elements covered in the guidance

**Part I: Introduction, objectives and key concepts**
- Understand the purpose and applicability of the guidance (Chapter 1)
- Determine the objectives of stakeholder participation (Chapter 2)
- Understand key concepts, elements and principles (Chapter 3)

**Part II: Key elements of effective stakeholder participation**
- Develop a stakeholder participation plan (Chapter 4)
- Identify and understand the stakeholders of the policy (Chapter 5)
- Create multi-stakeholder bodies (Chapter 6)
- Provide information to stakeholders (Chapter 7)
- Design and conduct consultations (Chapter 8)
- Establish a grievance redress mechanism (Chapter 9)

**Part III: Reporting on stakeholder participation**
- Report how stakeholder participation was designed and conducted (Chapter 10)
Introducing guidance to support the review of the impacts of policies and actions
Why technical review is important

- Enhance credibility, accuracy and comprehensiveness of the assessment through learning and improvement
- Enhance transparency and legitimacy of reported assessments
- Enable increased ambition in, and financing of, policies by strengthening the effectiveness of policies and the credibility of reporting
Overview of the guidance

Part I: Introduction, objectives, and key concepts
Understand the purpose and applicability of the guidance (Chapter 1)
Understand key concepts, steps and technical review principles (Chapter 2)

Part II: Overview of technical review
Understand the types of technical review that can be pursued (Chapter 3)
Learn about reviewer qualifications to inform team design and meet review objectives (Chapter 4)

Part III: Technical review process
Establish the objectives, scope and criteria of the technical review (Chapter 5)
Prepare the documents and evidence for technical review (Chapter 6)
Develop a technical review plan (Chapter 7)
Conduct the technical review using an established process (Chapter 8)
Report on the results of the technical review (Chapter 9)
Matrix for selecting a review type

**First-party:** the same government agency that is responsible for the implementation of the policy and/or the impact assessment

**Second-party:** a person or organisation that has an interest in or affiliation with the user

**Third-party:** a person or organisation independent from the user of commercial, financial or legal interests

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Considerations for technical review</th>
<th>High</th>
<th>Medium</th>
<th>Low</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Very</td>
<td>Somewhat</td>
<td>Slightly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Is the technical review of an ex-ante assessment?</td>
<td>First, Second</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Third</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. How difficult is it for entities other than the user to gain access to information, assumptions and data regarding the impact assessment?</td>
<td>First</td>
<td>Second</td>
<td>Third</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. How important is it for the technical reviewer to be, or to be perceived as, minimally vulnerable to conflicts of interest?</td>
<td>Third</td>
<td>Second</td>
<td>First</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. How experienced with undergoing technical review is the user?</td>
<td>First</td>
<td>Second</td>
<td>Third</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. How much funding is available for the technical review process?</td>
<td>Third</td>
<td>Second</td>
<td>First</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. What level of independence is necessary for the technical review?</td>
<td>Third</td>
<td>Second</td>
<td>First</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. What level of transparency and stakeholder confidence in the technical review results is necessary?</td>
<td>Third</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>First, Second</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Does the donor and/or private financier of the policy require technical review?</td>
<td>Second, Third</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>First</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Is it necessary for the reviewer to have an accreditation?</td>
<td>Third</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>First, Second</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Overview of the technical review process

1. **Determine objectives, criteria, scope and type of technical review**
2. **Prepare for technical review**
3. **Plan the technical review**
4. **Conduct technical review**
5. **Report on the technical review**
6. **Learn and improve for future assessments**

- Green: Completed by the user
- Blue: Completed by the reviewer

Conduct ex-ante or ex-post impact assessment
Public consultation via Collaborase

Collaborase is an online software that supports an unlimited number of reviewers and allows reviewers to more easily provide comments and navigate documents.
Initiative for Climate Action Transparency

Public Consultation

Accessing the guidance documents

To comment on the guidance, submit your email address on the document page(s) linked below. A confirmation email will be sent to your email account with a link to access the document.

| ICAT Introductory Guide                  | ICAT Sustainable Development Guidance |
| ICAT Renewable Energy Guidance          | ICAT Transformational Change Guidance |
| ICAT Buildings Efficiency Guidance      | ICAT Stakeholder Participation Guidance |
| ICAT Transport Pricing Guidance         | ICAT Technical Review Guidance        |
| ICAT Agriculture Guidance               | ICAT Non-State and Subnational Action Guidance |
| **ICAT Forest Guidance**                |                                       |
Accessing the documents

ICAT Forest Guidance

Submit comments
To post a comment, click the ‘Comment’ button below any section title. Where relevant, we recommend comments include (1) a comment title/issue and (2) a proposal for a change or new text. The comment form allows you to add images, files and/or links. You can also view comments that have already been submitted.

To view comments in a single section, click the ‘Comment’ button below the section title to display the list of comments for that section. Click the comment title to read the comment and any replies. To view all comments for the full document, click the ‘Comment’ tab at the top of the webpage – this will open the comments page with a searchable(sortable) table of all the comments. If you view comments by other reviewers, we encourage you to use the ‘Vote’ button to easily express your agreement or disagreement.

Enter your email address *

Submit
Note to Reviewers

Updated 6 days ago by Sinclair Vincent

Welcome to the ICAT Agriculture Guidance - thank you for taking time to review this guidance document. You can provide feedback by clicking on the 'Comments' button at the top of each section of the document. You can also comment or vote on other reviewers' comments. To answer optional survey questions, click the 'Survey' button at the top of the section. If you haven’t already, please provide the name of your organisation and country by clicking on the 'Survey' button above, which will help us analyse the results. For further information on using Collaborase please view this instructional video.

We hope you’ll enjoy reviewing the document. We invite you to provide all and any feedback you have on it. Some questions you might bear in mind as you read the document include:

- Do you have any general feedback on the guidance document?
- Do you think the guidance will help meet the needs of the intended users of the guidance document (e.g., understanding and reporting on impacts of policies and actions)?
- How user-friendly is the document? Does the document contain the right level of detail? Too long, too short?
- Are any topics missing that you would like to see covered?
- Would it be useful for ICAT to develop templates for assessment plans or assessment reports, or are users likely to prefer to use their own templates?

To access the other documents in the ICAT series of guidance, visit the ICAT Collaborase homepage.

Thank you again for taking the time to review this guidance document.

The ICAT team

ICAT Agriculture Guidance

Guidance for assessing the greenhouse gas impacts of agriculture policies
How to comment in Collaborase

9 Estimating Impacts Ex-Ante

Updated 15 days ago by Sinclair Vincent

This chapter describes how to estimate the expected future impacts of the policy or action (ex-ante assessment). In this chapter, users estimate policy scenario values for the indicators included in the assessment boundary. The impacts of the policy or action are estimated by subtracting baseline values (as determined in Chapter 8) from policy scenario values (as determined in this chapter). Users not quantitatively assessing impacts ex-ante can skip this chapter.

Figure 9.1: Overview of steps in the chapter

Define and describe the policy scenario for each indicator (Section 9.1) → Estimate policy scenario values for each indicator (Section 9.2) → Estimate the net impact of the policy or action on each indicator (Section 9.3)

Checklist of key recommendations

- Define a policy scenario that represents the conditions most likely to occur in the presence of the policy or action over time for each indicator being estimated, taking into account all specific impacts included in the quantitative assessment boundary
- Estimate the net impact of the policy or action on each indicator by subtracting baseline values from policy scenario values, taking into account all specific impacts included in the quantitative assessment boundary
- Separately assess the impacts of the policy or action on different groups in society where relevant
This chapter describes how to estimate the expected future impacts of the policy or action (ex-ante assessment). In this chapter, users estimate policy scenario values for the indicators included in the assessment boundary. The impacts of the policy or action are estimated by subtracting baseline values (as determined in Chapter 8) from policy scenario values (as determined in this chapter). Users not quantitatively assessing impacts ex-ante can skip this chapter.

Figure 9.1: Overview of steps in the chapter

- Define and describe the policy scenario for each indicator (Section 9.1)
- Estimate policy scenario values for each indicator (Section 9.2)
- Estimate the net impact of the policy or action on each indicator (Section 9.3)
How to comment in Collaborase

9.2 Estimate GHG impacts

Updated 12 days ago by Sinclair Vincent

Reviewer Comments

No Comments Yet

Add a comment

Issue* - brief description of a problem:
Deemed estimates approach

Proposal - suggested change or solution to the problem:
For users following the deemed estimates approach suggest allowing the following:
When using the deemed estimates approach, users can calculate the GHG impact of the policy directly, without explicitly defining separate baseline and policy scenarios. In this case, users should use the instructions in Section 8.6 with ex-post activity data and emission factors.

Estimate the GHG impact of the policy

Publish
How to comment in Collaborase

9.2 Estimate GHG impacts

Updated 12 days ago by Sinclair Vincent

Reviewer Comments

1 Open 0 Closed Newest

Deemed estimates approach

Reviewer Comment opened by Carolyn Ching 1 minute ago on version 2
9.2 Estimate GHG impacts

Deemed estimates approach

Estimate the GHG impact of the policy

Carolyn Ching:

For users following the deemed estimates approach suggest allowing the following:
When using the deemed estimates approach, users can calculate the GHG impact of the policy directly, without explicitly defining separate baseline and policy scenarios. In this case, users should use the instructions in Section 8.6 with ex-post activity data and emission factors.

Your reply

Publish
How to comment in Collaborase

9.2 Estimate GHG impacts

Updated 12 days ago by Sinclair Vincent

Reviewer Comments

1 Open 0 Closed Newest

Deemed estimates approach
Reviewer Comment opened by Carolyn Ching 2 minutes ago on version 2

New comment

1 like 0 dislikes
Answering survey questions in Collaborase

6 Choosing Which Transformational Change Characteristics to Assess

This chapter provides guidance on identifying and choosing transformational change characteristics that are relevant for a policy or action. It also defines the transformational change assessment boundary and the assessment period.

Figure 6.1: Overview of steps in the chapter

- Describe transformational change characteristics of the policy or action (Section 6.1)
- Choose transformational change characteristics to be assessed (Section 6.2)
- Define the assessment boundary and the assessment period (Section 6.3)

Checklist of key recommendations

- Identify and describe transformational characteristics of the policy or action
- Choose characteristics to be assessed based on their relevance to a policy or action and the society in which it is implemented
- Define the assessment boundary in terms of geographical and sectoral coverage of transformational characteristics selected for assessment
- Define the assessment period
This chapter describes characteristics of transformational impact. Are the descriptions of characteristics sufficient and clear enough to enable assessment of impacts for transformation specific to a policy or action? If not, how can we improve them?

It would be helpful if these descriptions could be more detailed.

In Table 6.4 users are asked to describe characteristics of transformational outcomes for GHG and SD at scale and over time. Is further guidance needed on how to use other ICAT guidance for GHG and SD impact assessment and how to assess impacts of multiple outcomes for GHG and SD?

- Yes
- No

The guidance provided is sufficient.
Collating and reviewing comments

**ICAT Agriculture Guidance**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Comments</th>
<th>Resources</th>
<th>Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**All Comments: Main**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Filters</th>
<th>0 results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Author comments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reviewer comments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My comments</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Active</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deferred</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accepted</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rejected</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

No Comments Yet
Questions?

To review the guidance and provide comments:


Public consultation closes 24 September 2017
Thank You

Karen Olsen, UNEP DTU Partnership
kaol@dtu.org

Questions about Collaborase:
Sinclair Vincent, VCS
svincent@v-c-s.org

www.climateactiontransparency.org